



*International Civil Aviation Organization*

**FOURTH MEETING OF THE ASIA PACIFIC ACCIDENT INVESTIGATION GROUP  
(APAC-AIG/4)**

*Tokyo, Japan, 1-2 September 2016*

---

**Agenda Item 6:      Action plan to improve the Accident/Incident investigation capability in  
the APAC Region**

**ENSURING IMPLEMENTATION OF  
SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS UNDER ANNEX 13**

*(Presented by Bangladesh)*

**SUMMARY**

Improving aviation safety by avoiding recurrence of accident/incident and implementation of safety recommendation is very important. Recommendations may be prioritized in two categories, one for avoiding recurrence and the other for improving aviation safety. It is considered to ensure accountability of member states with regard to implement safety recommendations. A common consensus for proposing an amendment of Annex-13 in order to ensure implementation of such safety recommendation(s) involved for avoidance of recurrence is required.

This paper proposes to consider an amendment into the applicable Standard concerning safety recommendation to Annex 13.

**1. INTRODUCTION**

1.1 Improving aviation safety largely depends on implementation of safety recommendations based on identified findings, effective analysis of factual information and/or collected safety data in particular for and from accident and incident investigation activities. The enhancement of aviation safety therefore requires the conduction of effective investigation and implementation of safety recommendations.

1.2 Avoiding recurrence of accident/serious incident, it is also very important to implement safety recommendations. However, this paper would like to focus on the standard of ICAO Annex 13 concerning responsibility of member states for implementations of safety recommendations.

1.3 It is implicit that, a State invests a lot of resources to establish an Aircraft Investigation process and train its personnel. When Safety Recommendations are prescribed in an Investigation Report, it is well known that the investigators spend time, knowledge and experience while stating that. So, if the effective implementation of the prescribed Safety Recommendations is not ensured in a standard manner, all the preceding activities of the Investigators as well as the function of the AIG of the state will be insignificant.

## 2. PROVISIONS OF ANNEX-13 ON IMPLEMENTATION OF SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS

2.1 Annex-13, Section-6.8 states that “At any stage of the investigation of an accident or incident, the accident or incident investigation authority of the State conducting the investigation **shall** recommend in a dated transmittal correspondence to the appropriate authorities, including those in other States, any preventive action that it considers necessary to be taken promptly to enhance aviation safety”.

2.2 Annex-13, Section-6.10 states that “A State that receives safety recommendations **shall** inform the proposing State, within ninety days of the date of the transmittal correspondence, of the preventive action taken or under consideration, or the reasons why no action will be taken”.

2.3 *Annex-13, Section-6.11 recommends that “A State conducting the investigation or any other State issuing a safety recommendation **should** implement procedures to record the responses to the safety recommendation issued.”*

2.4 *Annex-13, Section-6.12 recommends that “A State that receives a safety recommendation **should** implement procedures to monitor the progress of the action taken in response to that safety recommendation.*

## 3. PROTOCOL QUESTIONS OF ICAO USOAP CMA CONCERNING IMPLEMENTATION OF SAFETY RECOMMENDATION

### 3.1 Protocol Question of AIG 6.429 (CE-8) of ICAO USOAP CMA

Has the State developed and implemented procedures to record responses to the safety recommendations it has issued?

➤ Corresponding Reference: **RP** A13 6.11, GM Doc 9962 C 10

*Annex-13, Section-6.11 Recommendation.- A State conducting the investigation or any other State issuing a safety recommendation **should** implement procedures to record the responses to the safety recommendation issued*

### Protocol Question of AIG 6.507 (CE-8) of ICAO USOAP CMA

Has the State established an accident and incident database to facilitate the effective analysis of information on actual or potential safety deficiencies and to determine any preventive actions required?

➤ Corresponding Reference: STD A13 8.1

A State shall establish a mandatory incident reporting system to facilitate collection of information on actual or potential safety deficiencies.

### 3.2 Protocol Question of AIG 6.511 (CE-8) of ICAO USOAP CMA

Do the State authorities responsible for the implementation of the SSP have access to the accident and incident database to support their safety responsibilities and is the information contained in the accident/ incident reports and the database analysed to determine any required preventive actions?

- Corresponding Reference: STD A13 8.4 RP A13 8.7 8.8 8.9

**Recommendation.**— *If a State, in the analysis of the information contained in its , identifies safety matters considered to be of interest to other States, that State should forward such safety information to them as soon as possible.*

**Recommendation.**— *In addition to safety recommendations arising from accident and incident investigations, safety recommendations may result from diverse sources, including safety studies. If safety recommendations are addressed to an organization in another State, they should also be transmitted to that State's investigation authority.*

#### **Exchange of safety information**

**Recommendation.**— *States should promote the establishment of safety information sharing networks among all users of the aviation system and should facilitate the free exchange of information on actual and potential safety deficiencies.*

**Note.**— *Standardized definitions, classifications and formats are needed to facilitate data exchange. Guidance material on the specifications for such information-sharing networks will be provided by ICAO upon request.*

### **4. ANALYSIS OF STANDARD OF ANNEX-13 ON IMPLEMENTATION OF SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS**

4.1 ICAO, in Annex-13, is yet to set a Standard for which states are required to ensure implementation of safety recommendations of Accident Investigation Report. It is understood that non availability of specific Standard on effective implementation of safety recommendation may lead to not paying heed to implement of such recommendations where main objective of investigation is to prevent recurrence of accident/incident.

### **5. PROPOSAL OF THE PAPER**

5.1 In order to ensure enhancement of aviation safety and also avoid recurrence of accident/incident, requirement of implementation of safety recommendation cannot be put aside. ICAO could set forth a specific standard through an amendment of Annex-13 by which safety recommendation may be required to be categorized in investigation report in the following way:

- a) Safety Recommendation for avoiding recurrence of accident/serious incident;
- b) Safety Recommendation for enhancement of aviation safety.

5.2 In order to ensure avoiding recurrence of accident/incident, ICAO could set specific standard by which states shall ensure the implementation of safety recommendation of investigation report concerning avoiding recurrence of accident/incident.

5.3 This paper is proposing the amendments (highlighted) in the following sections of Annex-13 by which states are required to ensure the implementation of safety recommendation:

## **RESPONSIBILITY OF A STATE RECEIVING OR ISSUING SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS**

### **Action on safety recommendations**

Annex-13, Section-6.11:Recommendation.— A State conducting the investigation or any other State issuing a safety recommendation ~~should~~ **shall** implement procedures to record the responses to the safety recommendation issued.

Annex-13, Section-6.12:Recommendation.— A State that receives a safety recommendation ~~should~~ **shall** implement procedures to monitor **and record** the progress of the action taken ~~in response to~~ **on** that safety recommendation.

## **APPENDIX. FORMAT OF THE FINAL REPORT**

### **4. SAFETY RECOMMENDATIONS**

**As appropriate, safety recommendation shall be categorized as follows:**

- a) **Safety Recommendation for avoiding recurrence of accident/serious incident;**
- b) **Safety Recommendation for enhancement of aviation safety.**

## **6. JUSTIFICATION OF THE PROPOSAL**

6.1 The sole objective of the investigation of an accident or incident conducted under the provisions of Annex 13 shall be the prevention of accidents and incidents. The Final Report of an investigation, including its recommendations, is the catalyst for preventing further occurrences. The findings and the causes/contributing factors of Final Reports usually lead to safety recommendations so that appropriate preventive actions can be implemented. So, addressing of safety recommendations should get priority in order to prevent other accidents from similar causes or reduce the consequences of such accidents. But, present standards of Annex-13 may be considered inadequate for ensuring state's responsibility to address safety recommendations. So, specific standard in Annex-13 on addressing safety recommendations is required in order to ensure states responsibility.

## **7. ACTION BY THE MEETING**

7.1 The Meeting is invited to note that the proposed amendment to Annex 13 may be taken into consideration for ensuring the implementation of safety recommendation effectively.

— END —